Narrative Section of a Successful Application

The attached document contains the grant narrative and selected portions of a previously funded grant application. It is not intended to serve as a model, but to give you a sense of how a successful application may be crafted. Every successful application is different, and each applicant is urged to prepare a proposal that reflects its unique project and aspirations. Prospective applicants should consult the Research Programs application guidelines at http://www.neh.gov/grants/research/fellowships for instructions. Applicants are also strongly encouraged to consult with the NEH Division of Research Programs staff well before a grant deadline.

Note: The attachment only contains the grant narrative and selected portions, not the entire funded application. In addition, certain portions may have been redacted to protect the privacy interests of an individual and/or to protect confidential commercial and financial information and/or to protect copyrighted materials.

Project Title: Printers Without Borders: Translation, Transnationalism, and Early English Print Culture

Institution: Florida State University

Project Director: Anne Coldiron

Grant Program: Fellowships Program

Printers Without Borders: Translation, Transnationalism, and Early English Print Culture

"We owe our civilization to the translators," as Lewis Kelly famously said, acknowledging our debt to the mediators of alterity: to those who make the texts of one culture readable for another. Beyond such a general debt to translators, the literary culture of the English Renaissance owes much to the early printers, who made thousands of works available to expanding readerships in a relatively short time. Early printers and translators cooperated closely in their media revolution: indeed, many early English printers were themselves translators (Caxton, De Worde, Copland, Wyer, *et al.*). The printers needed content, and translators opened a vast store of works proven popular and salable on the continent; thanks to the printers, the translators brought their versions to many more readers than ever before possible. Each form of textual transmission accelerates possibilities inherent in the other.

Printers Without Borders studies translation, printing, and transnationalism in the first phases of the Renaissance media revolution. Both kinds of textual transformation--printing and translation-- helped develop English literary culture and nationhood, enriching English letters and shaping English identity and power. This book project thus builds on the work of such scholars as Helgerson, Hadfield, and MacEachern, who establish the centrality of early modern nationalism and nation- building in the 16th and 17th centuries. But by looking at the preceding century--the first crucial century after Caxton brought the press to England (1476)--and by focusing on these two allied processes of textual transformation, this project challenges and expands the usual view of the relation between nationhood and literature. In this early phase, printing and translation fostered not only the well-studied, emerging drive toward nationhood, but also a much less well-documented, less- discussed transnational drive. Certainly, printed books shaped English identity, but this project asks how the combined efforts of printers and translators allowed new English readers to understand themselves as part of a wider world. English readers of foreign manuscript texts had always had access to transnational understanding: Latinity and Christianity were strong cross-cultural glue. But while medieval literacy had usually meant polyglot literacy (Wogan-Browne), it had also usually meant a very restricted, elite-culture literacy dependent on access to manuscripts. Even as national vernacular literatures in print gained their respective ground(s)--a story well told in separate national literary histories--printer-translators were also creating transnational discourse communities by flooding the markets with naturalized works that were still visibly, vividly foreign (Venuti; Ong). This story is much less well told, especially for English literature. Thus one contribution of the project to the field of early modern studies will be to reveal how these joint agents of textual transformation, printers and translators, served simultaneous, opposing impulses toward nation and trans-nation: even in building English literary nationhood their work connected readerships and retained residual foreignness across emergent national boundaries.

Sometimes the printers and translators register the tension between nation and trans-nation (or multi-nation) openly in prefaces. Frenchman Peter Derendel, for one, says he translates so that English won't be "bastard allone" among languages. His metaphor suggests the lower status--the isolated illegitimacy--of English even as late as 1553, when he and other translators made versions of the *Quadrins historiques* in seven languages; it also figures a family of nations where translators and printers serve as irenic agents. Acutely aware of national differences, they make great bridging efforts both in the translations and in their paratexts (which often act as literary passports). Sometimes the facts of publication reveal a transnational impulse expressed via national contrasts: if a printer perceives enough shared elements in a work to imagine a pan-European audience for it, he still foregrounds national differences in each translation. The printer-translators' dual aim at one-"world" audience-market and also at multiple national audiences-markets may well have been irenic; it was certainly profitable (Raven; Halasz). Patterns of printed translation suggest that different commercial motives (importing-printers vs. exporting-printers) create different kinds of literary transnationalism. In tracking the printer-translators' efforts to imagine their intended readerships in both ways at once- --nationally and transnationally--the project expands the ideas in Benedict Anderson's classic *Imagined Communities.*

This project, moreover, stands at a crossroads in the history of two scholarly disciplines. Although printing and translation were mutually necessary co-operations in the Renaissance, the study of printing and the study of translation have largely developed separately since the 19th century, with printing traditionally studied as part of "history of the book" and translation studied as part of comparative literature. And yet, an important commonality emerges if we consider these two fields together: to study translation and printing together is to understand at once two crucial, synergistic processes by which cultural meanings are produced. Recently, each area of inquiry has undergone its own important revitalizations in method and theory, with exciting results in both fields. Since Eisenstein (1979), few discount the power of the early presses as "agents of change"; in the three decades since then, new textual scholars (Johns, Chartier, Kuskin, other "new bibliographers") have focused on the "sociology of texts" (McKenzie) and have insisted on recontextualizing the study of every phase of book creation, distribution, and use. Likewise, after Steiner (1975), it has been widely understood that most expressive activity has a translational aspect; since then, new translation scholars (e.g. Bassnett, Morini, Even-Zohar, Robinson) have raised further questions about cultural framing and literary globalism, and indeed about all the ways in which words cross cultures. As a result of these largely separate, sub-specialist developments in the wake of post-structuralism and new historicism, the wider field of literary studies is becoming increasingly aware of how material technologies shape the literary, on the one hand, and on the other, of how translation challenges authorship, periodization, and the idea of "national" literatures. That is, these two areas of inquiry, when considered together, converge to push at the very organizing categories and assumptions of literary study. Printing and translation were, for both pragmatic and theoretical reasons, intimately linked as prime agents of a literary Renaissance---that is a fact of history. But it is one we have only begun to explore. For this reason, and because I see the two areas of scholarly inquiry (translation studies and the new history of the book) as theoretically linked, I shall consider them jointly in this large book project. (This pairing has already shown promise; see CV.)

WORK PLAN. I seek support for a year's work at an early stage. By "early" I mean that lines of inquiry are clear, I have done preliminary work in the Bodleian, Morgan, & Folger Libraries, and the likeliest works to study are chosen. But no chapters are written, all need further research, and further archival travel will be required (especially to BL, BnF, Library of Congress, and Folger). Because of the foundationally francophone character of early English printing (see my "Public Sphere/Contact Zone"), the book uses French-English translation as the central model for discussing other forms of transnationalism. I have the languages required for most of this work (French; reading Latin, Spanish, & Italian) but will need to consult with expert colleagues on the relatively few & less central Dutch, German, Arabic, Greek, & Hebrew excerpts in the project. This book project aims at an interdisciplinary audience of scholars in English, Comparative, and French literatures; in literary theory, literary history, and book history/textual studies. Two university presses (OUP, CUP) & one scholarly publisher (Palgrave) have stated preliminary interest; my work plan is to devote full time to research and writing in 2010-2011, in order to complete a proposal-ready book draft.

CHAPTERS. The introductory **Chapter 1** will articulate what I see as a strongly analogous theoretical relation between printing and translation, and will also set out the historical basis for this analogy that I see in the printer-translators' biographies, historical contexts, and textual practices. The book will be roughly, superficially chronological, its real order being to examine different modes of textual transmission and how, in different modes, printing and translation energize transnationalism. **Chapter 2**, "Wandering Wisdom: alternatives to the *translatio studii*," studies the first book printed in England, the *Dictes and seyinges of the philosophres*. The *Dictes*, a translation from Tignonville's French version of the "Al-Hakim" ("Beautiful Sayings") of Arabic writer Al-Mubashshir (11thC), is a book of summaries of ancients' wisdom, including, e.g., anecdotes, mini-biographies, and quasi-scientific observations. Mediated through successive translations, but not in the typical line of the *translatio* (that is, not Greek-Latin-Italian-French-English), the Arabic content meanders among vernaculars with secondary offshoots to Latin; from French versions, it arrives in Caxton's English *Dictes*. My study does not deny the power or validity of the *translatio*, but many works like this one reveal another transnational path. That the first book printed in England was translated from French is no sur-

prise, but these multiple mediating versions deterritorialize (Deleuze & Guattari) wisdom literature. **Chapter 3**, "Transnational Critiques of Court: the French *Curial* and English Rebellions," will treat two versions of Alain Chartier's anti-court poem, the *Curial*, printed-translated in inflammatory historical moments (1484 & 1549) by key people connected to English rebellions. Although Chartier's poem was written in the context of late-medieval French politics and intrigues with the Holy Roman Empire, it takes on new meanings in its new English contexts. In 1484 Caxton prints the work, in the context of the power struggles around the accession to the throne (which passed violently from Edward IV to Richard III, and then to Henry VII [Tudor]); Caxton's patron and translator, Anthony Woodville, was executed by Richard III. The work is re-translated in 1549 by Francis Segar in the context of mid-Tudor rebellions. This chapter highlights topicality, the capacity of printed translations to speak truth to power transnationally and transhistorically, and the printer-translators' acute sensitivities to the transnational implications of their texts. Where Chapter 2 traces an irregular transmission line, this chapter examines distinct points of transmission separated by radically different contexts and purposes. **Chapter 4**, "Radiant transnationalism: *Les Quadrins historiques de la Bible*," treats the radiating transmission of a very popular Biblical picture-book printed in seven languages (including French and English, where this analysis begins). Like the emblem books that are its dissimilar cousins, this book's images would seem to be inherently transnational, easily reaching readers across what had been "world Christendom" with little translation required. Despite the transnational reach of a competing "international Protestantism," the printer creates elaborate paratexts to ease the work into the seven cultures; paratextual variations signal differences the printer perceived among the various national segments of the "world" audience he sought to reach. I have presented parts of this work in Oxford, UK, & at the 16th-Century Society Conference (2008). **Chapter 5** contains exciting new discoveries requiring time and travel to pursue. "The World in One Book: Polyglot Texts and English Print Culture" will examine a compressed form of textual transnationalism. Here, instead of printing separate editions of a work in several languages, printer-translators put several language versions in one volume, often but not always in multicolumn format. (The most familiar such polyglot works are Bibles, dictionaries, accounting manuals, travel guides, & pedagogical tools.) This chapter surveys those briefly but treats selected literary works printed in polyglot formats, focusing on two prominent cases. (1) Beza's epigram on the Armada victory, translated into 8 languages and printed on one remarkable broadside (see Appendix for an image). One extant copy is printed on vellum; its single polyglot page is a microcosm that calls out for answers about its readership, its translators, its polysystemic poetics (Even-Zohar). Yet this work has received almost no scholarly notice. (2) The trilingual edition of *Il Cortegiano*. This text has also received less study than it warrants, given its suggestive *mise-en-page*: Castiglione's Italian is in italic type in the gutters at center page; French, mid-page in elegant Roman; English at the outer margins in blackletter (passé on the continent long before 1588). This chapter adds cross-cultural examples to book historians' work on format & typography as signifying features, and opens us in a new way to the several Elizabethan printers like John Wolfe, Newberry & Bishop, or Richard Field (aka Ricardo del Campo) who operate transnationally whether or not they ever leave St Paul's.

The **Epilogue**, "Make One Little Poem An Everywhere: Macaronic Verse in England," will briefly treat the most compressed form of textual transnationalism in print: macaronic verse (poems in more than one language). The best-known early-modern macaronic verse is Skelton's, but many other practitioners, often non-elite, used this cross-cultural wordplay. These poems offer an intimate integration of Others into English poetry--bilingual puns, "inkhorn terms," allusiveness, syntactical and phonetic variety--and they reveal English encounters with the foreign in printed microcosm.

This study seeks to expand current thinking about how literature both reflects and shapes ideas of nation and trans-nation, and to illustrate the crucial collaborative roles of printers and translators in the development of early English print culture. Each translation is an interpretation, a point of cross-cultural contact: studying how texts move between languages and media---between whole systems of literary production, distribution, and reception---we can better understand what separates cultures and what they share.

SELECTED PRIMARY TEXTS: Mubashshir ibn F̄atik, A. *The dictes and ... sayenges of the phylosophres.* Westminster: Caxton, 1477 et seq.   Chartier, Alain. *Le Curial.* Tr. Caxton. Westminster: Caxton, 1483; Tr. F. Segar. London: Day & Seres[?], 1549.   Anon., *Salomon & Marcolphus.* Antwerp: Leeu, 1492; anr.ed., London: Pynson,1529.   Gringore, Pierre. *Le Chasteau de Labour.* Paris: Pigouchet, 1499; *The Castell of Labour.* London: Pynson, 1505.   Anon. *Kalendayr of the Shyppars.* Paris: Vérard, 1503; London: 1506 et seq.   Anon. *Ordinaire des chrétiens/Thordynary of crysten men.* Tr. A. Chertsey. London: de Worde, 1506.   Anon. *The Ship of Fools,* London: de Worde, 1509.   *Kynge Appolyn of Thyre.* London: de Worde, 1510.   Guevara, Antonio de. *The golden boke of Marcus Aurelius.* Tr. J.Bourchier. London: T. Berthelet, 1535.   Paradin, Claude. *Quadrins Historiques de la Bible./True & lyuely historique portratures of the woll bible.* Lyon: J. de Tournes, 1553 et seq.. Castiglione, B. *The Courtier.* London: J. Wolfe, 1588.   Bèze, Théodore de. *Ad serenissimam Elizabetham angliae reginam Theodor Beza.* London: G. B[ishop] & R. N[ewbery], 1588.

SELECTED SECONDARY WORKS:

Anderson, B. *Imagined Communities.* London: Verso, 2006.

Bassnett, S. *Post-colonial Translation Theory and Practice.* London; NY: Routledge, 2002.

---, & A. Lefevere. *Constructing Cultures.* Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters, 1998.

Chartier, R. *The Order of Books.* Stanford: Stanford UP, 1994.

Deleuze, G., & F. Guattari. *Kafka: pour une Littérature mineure.* Paris: Minuit, 1975.

Driver, M. *The Image in Print.* London: British Library, 2004.

Eisenstein, E. L. *The Printing Press as an Agent of Change.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1979.

Even-Zohar, I. *Polysystem Studies (Poetics Today).* Durham, NC: Duke UP, 1990.

Fraser, R., & M. Hammond, eds. *Books Without Borders: Perspectives from South Asia.* NY: Palgrave, 2008

Genette, G. *Seuils.* Paris: Seuil, 2002.

Gillespie, A. *Print Culture and the Medieval Author.* Oxford: Oxford UP, 2006.

Hadfield, A. *Literature, Politics, and National Identity.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994.

Halasz, A. *The Marketplace of Print.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1997.

Helgerson, R. *Forms of Nationhood.* Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1992.

Johns, A. *The Nature of the Book.* Chicago: U. of Chicago P., 1998.

Kelly, L. G. *The True Interpreter.* NY: St. Martin's Press, 1979.

Kuskin, W. *Caxton's Trace.* Notre Dame: U of Notre Dame P, 2006.

---. *Symbolic Caxton.* Notre Dame: U of Notre Dame P, 2008.

May, S. & W. A Ringler. *Elizabethan Poetry.* 3 vols. London & NY: Thoemmes Continuum, 2004.

McEachern, C. *The Poetics of English Nationhood, 1580-1612.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996.

McGann, J. J. *Radiant Textuality.* NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002.

McKenzie, D. F. *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1999.

Morini, M. *Tudor Translation in Theory and Practice.* Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006.

Newman, K. *Cultural Capitals: Early Modern London and Paris.* Princeton: Princeton UP, 2007.

Ong, W. J. "Oral Residue in Tudor Prose Style." *PMLA* 80.3 (1965): 145-54.

The Oxford History of Literary Translation in English. Vol. 1, ed. R. Ellis, OUP, 2008; vol. 2, ed. G.
         Braden. Oxford: OUP, in progress.

Raven, J. *The Business of Books.* New Haven: Yale UP, 2007.

Ringler, W. *Bibliography and Index of English Verse Printed 1476-1558.* London: Mansell, 1988.

Robinson, D. *What Is Translation?* Kent, Ohio: Kent State UP, 1997.

Singh, J. G. *A Companion to the Global Renaissance.* Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009.

Steiner, G. *After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation.* NY: Oxford UP, 1975.

Stierle, K. "*Translatio studii* and Renaissance…" *The Translatability of Cultures.* Ed. S. Budick & W. Iser.
         Stanford: Stanford UP, 1996.

Venuti, L. *The Translator's Invisibility.* London; NY: Routledge, 1995.

Wallace, D. *Premodern Places.* Malden: Blackwell, 2004.

Williams, D. *The French Fetish from Chaucer to Shakespeare.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004.

Wogan-Browne, J. ed. *Language and Culture in Medieval Britain.* Melton, UK: York Medieval P, 2009.